Critical Thinking Indicators (CTIs)

2014 EVIDENCE–BASED VERSION

Contents

- Introduction
  Relationship of Critical Thinking and Clinical Reasoning ............................. 2
- Definition / How Were the CTIs Developed? .................................................... 3
- Underlying Assumptions ................................................................................. 4
- 4-Circle CT Model ......................................................................................... 6
- CTIs Demonstrating Personal CT Characteristics / Attitudes ........................ 7
- CTIs Demonstrating Knowledge and Intellectual Skills ................................. 8
- Example of using CTIs together with 4-Circle CT Model ............................ 9
- References .................................................................................................... 10

Rosalinda Alfaro-LeFevre RN, MSN, ANEF
Teaching Smart / Learning Easy
6161 S.E. Landing Way #9, Stuart, FL 34997
Phone 772-220-6873 Fax 772-382-3242
www.AlfaroTeachSmart.com

INTRODUCTION

Critical thinking (CT) and clinical reasoning (CR) are central to safety, learning and cost-effective, quality care. Yet, many nurses are unable to articulate what these two types of reasoning involve. To improve reasoning, leaders, teachers, nurses and learners must be “on the same page” about exactly what CT and CR entail. This document and companion books (page 5) help you “think out loud” and dialogue about thinking in meaningful, evidence-based ways. After reading this document, you should be able to:

1. Describe what CT and CR entail, including the relationship between these terms.
2. Explain what critical thinking indicators (CTIs) are, and what evidence supports them.
3. Use the 4-Circle CT Model® together with the CTIs to develop your reasoning skills.
4. Identify strategies to promote (teach/learn) and assess (evaluate) CT ability.

RELATIONSHIP OF CRITICAL THINKING AND CLINICAL REASONING

Nurses use the terms critical thinking (CT) and clinical reasoning (CR) interchangeably, as many of the principles behind them are the same. There is, however, a slight difference. CR is a specific term that refers to managing patient issues at the point of care. According to ANA standards1,2, this means use of nursing process (Assessment, Diagnosis, Planning, Implementation and Evaluation). For reasoning about other clinical issues (e.g., teamwork, collaboration and streamlining work flow), nurses usually use the term CT. CT is a broad term that includes CR and refers to “important thinking” you need to do to assess, prevent, or manage any situation (inside or outside of the clinical setting).

CTIs describe behaviors that demonstrate the knowledge, attitudes, and skills that promote critical thinking. They give concrete examples of what you need to observe and do to assess and improve thinking. They give a detailed reference list to promote dialogue about the specific thinking skills you need to succeed today. Complete content on this topic can be found in Critical Thinking, Clinical Reasoning & Clinical Judgment: A Practical Approach 5th Ed (2013), and Applying Nursing Process: The Foundation for Clinical Reasoning, 8th Ed (2014). To learn more about these books, click here: http://www.alfaroteachsmart.com/books.html. Feedback and questions are welcomed.

TERMS OF USE

- You may use the contents if this document for informational and personal use only. For all other uses, you must complete the online permissions form at: http://www.alfaroteachsmart.com/NewOtherReq.htm
- You may not modify the information found in this document without written permission from.
- No part of this document may be reproduced, transmitted, or otherwise distributed in any form or by any means without permission (posting on the Internet, survey monkey, other electronic use, photocopies or PowerPoint use requires permission).
- Integrating this content into any document, information system, or other media requires permission.
- We welcome reprint, Intranet posting, and other licensing requests. Licensing includes use of new CT tools and all handouts and PowerPoint posted at www.AlfaroTeachSmart.com. Each request is considered individually. All requests must be entered online.
- For frequently asked questions (FAQs) on the use of copyrighted material, click below: http://www.copyright.com/viewPage.do?pageCode=cr11-n
- If you require your students to purchase Alfaro-LeFevre textbooks, you may make copies for students use so long as you complete the online permissions form
DEFINITION

Critical thinking is outcome-focused (results-oriented) thinking that:

- Is guided by standards, policies and procedures, ethics codes, and laws (individual state practice acts and state boards of nursing).
- Is based on principles of nursing process, problem-solving, and the scientific method (requires forming opinions and making decisions based on evidence).
- Carefully identifies the key problems, issues, and risks involved, engaging patients, families, and key stakeholders in decision-making early in the process.
- Applies logic, intuition, and creativity and is grounded in specific knowledge, skills, and experience.
- Is driven by patient, family, and community needs, as well as nurses’ needs to give competent efficient care (e.g. streamlining charting to free nurses for patient care).
- Calls for strategies that make the most of human potential and compensate for problems created by human nature (e.g., finding ways to prevent errors, using information technology, and overcoming the powerful influence of personal views).
- Focuses on safety and quality, constantly re-evaluating, self-correcting, and striving to improve.

HOW WERE THE CTIs DEVELOPED?

The process for developing the CTIs follows here.

- **Version 1.** In 2001, I developed a list of behaviors that I believed promoted critical thinking based on observation, reflection, and analysis during my work as a clinician, educator, consultant, and author. I then studied key literature related to critical thinking in nursing and compared my own work with the data in the literature. I added missing behaviors to the list.

- **Version 2.** In 2002, in my workshops, and via the Internet, I asked expert and staff nurses to comment on whether they agreed that the listed indicators were indeed behaviors that promoted critical thinking. I revised the indicators based on their input. I then conducted a formal study to validate the indicators. Through the use of questionnaires, expert and staff nurses were asked to decide to what extent each of the indicators were behaviors seen in critical thinkers. Data from 120 respondents suggested that most nurses strongly agreed that the indicators were behaviors that promote critical thinking.

- **Version 3.** From 2002-2009, indicators were revised based on new nursing literature and expert review. In 2010, major revision and re-organization was done to make concepts easier to grasp — and to address the importance of engaging patients and families, developing skilled communication, promoting healthy workplace standards, and safety and learning cultures. Implications of staffing shortages were included.

- **Version 4 (2014).** A survey was done asking nurses to validate the updated Personal CTIs (page 7). Nurses strongly agreed that these behaviors were seen in critical thinkers (to download summary, click here: http://www.alfaroteachsmart.com/CTI%20SurveySummary2013.pdf).

---

*Stakeholders* are the people who will be most affected by care (patients and families) or from whom requirements will be drawn (caregivers, insurance companies, third party payers, healthcare organizations.)
This document is NOT meant to stand alone. It doesn’t replace the need for deep understanding of critical thinking and clinical reasoning in nursing, including: 1) the complexity and circumstances of various clinical situations, 2) how culture and diverse thinking, personality, and learning styles affect thinking, 3) what factors influence reasoning ability, and 4) the many sensitive issues related to assessment, teaching, and evaluation. For this reason, the CTIs are meant to be used in conjunction with the accompanying textbooks (page 5) and other related resources and literature.

UNDERLYING ASSUMPTIONS

• Because CT and CR are contextual (they change with circumstances), you should consider three different types of reasoning.
  1. **Thinking Ahead:** Being proactive — anticipating what might happen and what you might do to be more prepared before encountering situations. For novices, with limited knowledge and experience, being proactive is difficult and sometimes restricted to reviewing procedure manuals and other resources.
  2. **Thinking in Action:** Thinking “on your feet” — rapid, dynamic reasoning that considers several cues and priorities at once, making it difficult to describe. Thinking in action is highly influenced by previous hands-on experience. It’s more intuitive and prone to “knee-jerk” responses than the other types of reasoning listed here.
  3. **Thinking Back (Reflecting on Thinking):** Deconstructing and analyzing the reasoning process used to identify assumptions, look for flaws and omissions, gain better understanding, and correct and improve thinking. Experienced clinicians double check and reflect on their thinking in dynamic ways during thinking in action. However, this doesn’t replace reflective thinking that happens after the fact. Deliberate reflective thinking that happens after the fact — for example, chart reviews, journaling, and open dialogue with others — brings new insights and greater accuracy. You can objectively identify “lessons learned” from experience.

• Patient and caregiver engagement, safety, and welfare and must be central to all critical thinking in nursing.

• Agreeing to a code of conduct (Health Team Code of Conduct) and maintaining a healthy work environment and learning culture are required to develop CT skills.

• While clinical simulation and classroom content are important starting points for CT development, you develop competent reasoning skills on the job.

• No one is a mind reader. To assess thinking, observe **behavior** (actions and verbal and written communications). Ask nurses to explain their **intent** (motives) and examine their results over time (e.g., assess their patients directly; review their charting, consider peer input). If you’re unsure about messages sent by behavior, clarify **intent**. For example, say, “Help me understand what you’re trying to do, and why and how you’re trying to do it.”

• Assessment of reasoning is **subjective** and highly influenced by the knowledge, thinking, and personality styles of those doing the assessment. For this reason, to make assessment **as objective as possible** do the following:
  1) Ensure that people doing the assessment use specific tools to assess and promote thinking.
  2) Have more than one person assess behavior using the same criteria,
  3) Focus on patterns of behavior and usual results, rather than single incidents.
  4) Be sure that nurses who are being evaluated know what exactly what behaviors are being assessed.

• Mutual understanding of expectations and a sense of trust between the teacher and learner are key to assessing and improving thinking. Learners should be encouraged to identify ways to improve their thinking in their own way (each person knows him or herself best).
• Knowing how to give and take feedback (constructive criticism) is a key skill required to be able to improve thinking. You can find specific strategies for giving and taking feedback in chapter 6 of *Critical Thinking and Clinical Judgment, 5th Ed* (2013).

• To evaluate and improve thinking, you need a deep understanding of the implications of personality and learning style preferences.

• Even the best critical thinkers’ reasoning abilities varies, depending on circumstances such as confidence, experience, practice, and familiarity with the people and situations at hand.

• The three CTI categories (Characteristics, Knowledge, and Intellectual Skills) are inter-related. The ability to demonstrate *knowledge indicators* (page 8) alone does not imply critical thinking. Critical thinking requires being able to apply knowledge to get results in real situations.

• Knowledge CTIs should be as specific as possible: Add or revise CTIs based on the context in which they are used. For example, for specialty practices such as maternal-child nursing, make an addendum page that includes specific knowledge needed to practice maternal-child nursing. If you have recommendations for specialty practice indicators, please let us know by clicking on CONTACT US at [www.AlfaroTeachSmart.com](http://www.AlfaroTeachSmart.com).

• The CTIs should not be used uncritically — as you read them, ask yourself how, why, and whether they apply to the context in which you teach or practice. Delete those that don’t apply, add indicators as needed. The first step for using the CTIs is to ask for agreement among users that the indicators are indeed behaviors that promote CT.

• Because the CTIs give clear descriptions of what you need to do to demonstrate critical thinking, share them with students and nurses early in their learning.

• The CTIs are listed in context of what’s expected to be observed in registered nurses. Some behaviors may not be appropriate for some levels of students and nurses.

• Using the CTIs (a logical, left-brained approach) together with the 4-Circle CT Model (a graphic, right-brained approach) increases understanding of critical thinking by looking at CT from different perspectives.

• The CTI of “health-oriented” (page 7) points out that poor health — especially if accompanied by uncomfortable symptoms (e.g., fatigue or headache) — impedes thinking.
The 4-Circle CT Model above gives “a picture” of what it takes to think critically. Going clockwise above, here’s what you need to do:

1) Develop CT characteristics and behaviors (see page 7). When someone has CT characteristics, the skills in the other circles come readily.

2) Acquire theoretical and experiential knowledge, as well as intellectual skills related to nursing process.*

3) Gain interpersonal skills. If you can’t get along with others, you’ll be unlikely to think critically because you’ll be “out of the loop” (people will avoid you). On the other end of the spectrum, if you’re “too nice” to confront or give criticism, you contribute little to others’ CT and often lose brainpower to stress*. 4) If you don’t have the related technical skills (for example, IV’s, N/G’s, computer skills) you’ll have less brain power for critical thinking (due to the “brain-drain” of learning technical skills). An easy way to use the 4-Circle Model is to simply draw lines pointing out from the circles, then add the skills you want to work on at the end of the line (page 10 is a guide to helping you do this)

*Chapter 5 of Critical Thinking, Clinical Reasoning, and Clinical Judgment gives case scenarios and practice exercises for acquiring key intellectual skills related to nursing process. Chapter 6 gives detailed guidelines for interpersonal skills such as how to give bad news, deal with complaints, work as a team, and manage conflict constructively. Applying Nursing Process focuses on CT skills in context of each phase of the nursing process.
PERSONAL CRITICAL THINKING INDICATORS (CTIs)

PERSONAL CTIs are brief descriptions of behaviors, attitudes and characteristics often seen in critical thinkers. These are the behaviors that promote development of CT habits. The below is the ideal — no one’s perfect. Characteristics vary depending on circumstances such as comfort and familiarity with the people and situations at hand. What matters is patterns of behavior over time (is the behavior usually evident?). If you’re a critical thinker, you probably can pick some characteristics you’d like to improve (critical thinkers are inately focused on improvement).

- **SELF-AWARE:** Identifies own learning, personality, and communication style preferences; clarifies biases, strengths, and limitations; acknowledges when thinking may be influenced by emotions or self-interest.
- **GENUINE / AUTHENTIC:** Shows true self; demonstrates behaviors that indicate stated values.
- **EFFECTIVE COMMUNICATOR:** Listens well (shows deep understanding of others’ thoughts, feelings and circumstances); speaks and writes with clarity (gets key points across to others).
- **CURIOUS AND INQUISITIVE:** Asks questions; looks for reasons, explanations, and meaning; seeks new information to broaden understanding.
- **ALERT TO CONTEXT:** Looks for changes in circumstances that warrant a need to modify approaches; investigates thoroughly when situations warrant precise, in depth thinking.
- **REFLECTIVE AND SELF-CORRECTIVE:** Carefully considers meaning of data and interpersonal interactions, asks for feedback; corrects own thinking, alert to potential errors by self and others, finds ways to avoid future mistakes.
- **ANALYTICAL AND INSIGHTFUL:** Identifies relationships; expresses deep understanding.
- **LOGICAL AND INTUITIVE:** Draws reasonable conclusions (if this is so, then it follows that because...); uses intuition as a guide; acts on intuition only with knowledge of risks involved.
- **CONFIDENT AND RESILIENT:** Expresses faith in ability to reason and learn; overcomes problems and disappointments.
- **HONEST AND UPRIGHT:** Looks for the truth, even if it sheds unwanted light; demonstrates integrity (adheres to moral and ethical standards; admits flaws in thinking).
- **AUTONOMOUS / RESPONSIBLE:** Self-directed, self-disciplined, and accepts accountability.
- **CAREFUL AND PRUDENT:** Seeks help as needed; suspends or revises judgment as indicated by new or incomplete data
- **OPEN AND FAIR-MINDED:** Shows tolerance for different viewpoints; questions how own viewpoints are influencing thinking.
- **SENSITIVE TO DIVERSITY:** Expresses appreciation of human differences related to values, culture, personality, or learning style preferences; adapts to preferences when feasible.
- **CREATIVE:** Offers alternative solutions and approaches; comes up with useful ideas.
- **REALISTIC AND PRACTICAL:** Admits when things aren’t feasible; looks for useful solutions.
- **PROACTIVE:** Anticipates consequences, plans ahead, acts on opportunities.
- **COURAGEOUS:** Stands up for beliefs, advocates for others, doesn’t hide from challenges.
- **PATIENT AND PERSISTENT:** Waits for right moment; perseveres to achieve best results.
- **FLEXIBLE:** Changes approaches as needed to get the best results.
- **HEALTH-ORIENTED:** Promotes a healthy lifestyle; uses healthy behaviors to manage stress.
- **IMPROVEMENT-ORIENTED (SELF, PATIENTS, SYSTEMS):** **SELF**— Identifies learning needs; finds ways to overcome limitations, seeks out new knowledge. **PATIENTS**— Promotes health; maximizes function, comfort, and convenience. **SYSTEMS**— Identifies risks and problems with health care systems; promotes safety, quality, satisfaction, and cost containment.
### KNOWLEDGE AND INTELLECTUAL CTIs

#### KNOWLEDGE

**Requirements vary**, depending on context (e.g. specialty practice):

- Relates Knowledge of:
  - Nursing and medical terminology
  - Nursing vs. medical and other models, roles, and responsibilities.
  - Scope of nursing practice (qualifications; applicable standards, laws, and rules and regulations).
  - Related anatomy, physiology, and pathophysiology
  - Spiritual, social, and cultural concepts
  - Normal and abnormal growth and development (pediatric, adult, and gerontologic implications).
  - Normal and abnormal function (bio-psycho-social-cultural-spiritual)
  - Factors affecting normal function (bio-psycho-social-cultural-spiritual)
  - Nutrition and pharmacology principles
  - Behavioral health and disease management
  - Signs and symptoms of common problems and complications.
  - Nursing process, nursing theories, research, and evidence-based practice.
  - Reasons behind policies, procedures and interventions; diagnostic studies implications
  - Ethical and legal principles
  - Risk management and infection control
  - Safety standards, healthy workplace standards, and principles of learning and safety cultures
  - Inter-relationship of healthcare disciplines and systems.
  - Reliable information resources

**Demonstrates:**

- Focused nursing assessment skills (e.g. breath sounds or IV site assessment)
- Mathematical problem solving for drug calculations
- Related technical skills (e.g. n/g tube or other equipment management)

**Clarifies:**

- Personal biases, values, beliefs, needs
- How own culture, thinking, personality, and learning style preferences differ from others'
- Level of commitment to organizational mission and values

---

#### INTELLECTUAL SKILLS / COMPETENCIES

**Demonstrates nursing process and decision-making skills:**

- Communicates effectively orally and in writing
- Identifies practice scope: applies standards, principles, laws, and ethics codes
- Makes safety and infection control a priority; prevents and deals with mistakes constructively
- Includes patient, family, and key stakeholders in decision-making; teaches patient, self and others
- Identifies purpose and focus of assessment
- Assesses systematically and comprehensively.
- Distinguishes normal from abnormal; identifies risks for abnormal
- Distinguishes relevant from irrelevant; clusters relevant data together
- Identifies assumptions and inconsistencies; checks accuracy and reliability (validates data)
- Recognizes missing information; gains more data as needed.
- Concludes what’s known and unknown; draws reasonable conclusions — gives evidence to support them
- Identifies both problems and their underlying cause(s) and related factors; includes patient and family perspectives
- Recognizes changes in patient status; takes appropriate action
- Considers multiple ideas, explanations, and solutions
- Determines individualized outcomes and uses them to plan and give care
- Manages risks, predicts complications
- Weighs risks and benefits; anticipates consequences and implications — individualizes interventions accordingly
- Sets priorities and makes decisions in a timely way
- Reassesses to monitor outcomes (responses)
- Promotes health, function, comfort, and well-being
- Identifies ethical issues and takes appropriate action
- Uses human and information resources; detects bias

**Additional Related Skills:**

- Advocates for patients, self, and others
- Engages and empowers patients, families, peers, and coworkers
- Fosters positive interpersonal relationships; addresses conflicts fairly; promotes health workplace and learning cultures
- Promotes teamwork (focuses on common goals, respects diversity; encourages others to contribute in their own way)
- Facilitates and navigates change
- Organizes and manages time and environment
- Gives and takes constructive criticism
- Delegates appropriately (matches patient needs with worker competencies; determines worker learning needs, supervises and teaches as indicated; monitors results personally)
- Leads, inspires, and helps others move toward common goals.
- Demonstrates systems thinking (shows awareness of relationships existing within and across healthcare systems).
EXAMPLE OF USING 4 CIRCLE MODEL TOGETHER WITH CTIs

INSTRUCTIONS: Going clockwise, identify relationships by matching boxes with circles. CTIs are abbreviated.

CIRCLE #1
- Self-aware; authentic
- Effective Communicator
- Curious / inquisitive
- Self-disciplined
- Confident / resilient
- Analytical / insightful
- Autonomous / responsible
- Honest / upright
- Alert to context
- Proactive
- Patient / persistent
- Logical and intuitive
- Creative
- Realistic / practical
- Open and fair-minded
- Sensitive to diversity:
- Reflective / self-corrective
- Improvement-oriented

CIRCLE #2
- Communicates effectively orally and in writing.
- Promotes safety and infection control
- Applies standards, ethics codes, and nursing process principles
- Identifies scope of practice
- Includes patients in decision-making; teaches patients, self and others
- Assesses systematically and comprehensively
- Distinguishes normal from abnormal and relevant from irrelevant
- Checks accuracy and reliability
- Identifies assumptions and inconsistencies
- Determines credibility; detects bias.
- Concludes what’s known and unknown; recognizes missing information.
- Considers multiple explanations and solutions
- Determines individualized outcomes
- Weighs risks and benefits;
- Individualizes interventions
- Reassesses to check responses
- Manages risks, predicts complications, promotes optimum well being
- Sets priorities; makes decisions in a timely way
- Applies evidence / research
- Identifies ethical issues — takes appropriate action
- Delegates appropriately
- Uses human and information resources

CIRCLE #3
- Uses skilled communication in high stake situations
- Establishes empowered partnerships
- Fosters positive interpersonal relationships; promotes teamwork
- Gives and takes constructive criticism
- Addresses conflicts fairly
- Deals with complaints constructively
- Upholds healthy workplace standards
- Promotes a learning and safety culture
- Leads, motivates, and manages others
- Advocates for patients, self, and others
- Facilitates and navigates change
- Manages stress, time, & energy

CIRCLE #4
- Manages IVs
- Gives injections
- Manages N/G’s
- Manages monitoring & treatment devices
- Inserts / manages catheters
- Manages drains & suction equipment
- Uses computers
- Inserts / manages rectal tubes
- Maintains cleanliness & sterility
- Changes Dressings

CRITICAL THINKING ABILITY

(1) Critical Thinking Characteristics / Attitudes / Behaviors
(2) Theoretical & Experiential Knowledge / Intellectual Competencies
(3) Interpersonal Skills/ Competencies
(4) Technical Skills / Competencies
REFERENCES


RECOMMENDED

ASK US ABOUT OUR NEW CT TOOLS. NOW AVAILABLE!

• Clinical Decision-making — Scope of Practice
• When and How to Delegate
• Healthy Workplace and Safety and Learning Cultures
• Quick Priority Assessments

Download Creating a Climate to Promote Critical Thinking: 15 Things to Do from the following link (choose Handout # 14 – may be copied free): http://www.alfaroteachsmart.com/handouts.html.

© 2002 – 2014 R. Alfarom-LeFevre ♦ All rights reserved. No use without written permission. www.AlfarTeachSmart.com